



O U R C

**Captains' Meeting Minutes**  
**Wednesday 6th Week Michaelmas Term 2008**  
**8pm, Balliol College**

1. **The Chair**

Colin Groshong chaired the meeting at the request of Colin Smith.

2. **Minutes Of The Last Meeting**

Available at (<http://www.ourcs.org.uk/files/file/minutes/CM1%20Minutes.pdf>)

3. **Matters Arising**

4. **Announcements – Part 1**

a. **Hinksey Sculling School**

Ed Nicholas, the head of the Sports Fed, said that there was funding available from the Sports Fed for outreach work. The club in question could earn £75 once its members worked a total of 10 hours, and each of them would earn an hourly rate of £7.50.

Tom Collins, the Director of Rowing and Head Coach at Hinksey, then described the club. It was to bring rowing to state schools, and has links with 5 schools in Oxford, both primary and secondary. He would appreciate college and squad clubs volunteering groups of people to work with the school children on ergs one afternoon a week, 3.30-4.45 pm. There was also an opportunity to coach the water sessions, but you need to have the ARA Level 2 qualification. If you are in it for the long haul the club will help you get this qualification.

Contacts are:

Ed Nicholas: [edward.nicholas@sport.ox.ac.uk](mailto:edward.nicholas@sport.ox.ac.uk)

Tom Collins: [tom@hinkseysculling.org.uk](mailto:tom@hinkseysculling.org.uk)

5. **Questions to the Christ Church Regatta Organising Committee**

New, Men asked why entry fees had gone up to £45.

Andy Pearson, of the organising committee, replied that the fee was actually £42, and had only gone up £2.

Trinity, Men asked about the substitution rules, as to whether it was possible for someone in the B crew to sub into the A crew for a race, but then return to the B crew afterwards.

AP replied that people could be subbed up, but not down (ie from the B crew into the A crew, but not vice versa), and then back down again when the person they were subbing for returned. He did not, though, want to see the subs holding seats for a period of time, and then expecting to return to their original boat.

6. **Squad Reports**

a. **OUWLRC**

The squad has halved in size to 10 athletes, though the standard of the top 8 is very high, higher than last year.

At the British Indoor Rowing Championships in October the club got great results, winning silver (Rachel Hall) and bronze (Felicity Hawksley) in the Student Lightweight Women category.

Two crews entered the Fours Head, again achieving good results. The top crew came second in the Women's Sen 3 4+ category by 3.5 seconds. The second crew was only 6 seconds behind, coming in 4th.

b. OUWBC

A successful season so far. At the BUCS 2k did well, most rowers PBing. The club got a bronze in the Women's Champ 2- at the BUCS Small Boats Head. At the Fours Head, the club just missed out on pennants: 2<sup>nd</sup> in Women's Sen 2 4-, 2<sup>nd</sup> in Women's Sen 2 4+, and 3<sup>rd</sup> in Women's Sen 3 4+. Despite this disappointment, results in comparison to Cambridge were good. The club has entered Wallingford Head.

An 8 hour ergathon raised £400, with bowside beating strokeside 112,000 to 110,000m.

Raffle tickets are available with great prizes on offer.

Those college rowers who have been rowing with the club for the last week seem to have had a great experience.

c. OULRC

The club are training hard. Lactate and VO2 testing have been done at Brookes. Two boats entered the Fours Head, coming 8<sup>th</sup> and 18<sup>th</sup> in Men's Sen 3 4+. There is room for improvement, and the club thanks the colleges who lent them boats. The club will be racing at Marlow Pairs and Fours Head. Then its on to Trial Eights on 7<sup>th</sup> December. Nephthys regatta has had 104 entries.

d. OUBC

The club did not achieve what it wanted to at the Fours Head, but there has been a good response since then. Trial Eights will be held on 8<sup>th</sup> December. There have been some illness and injuries, but the squad is doing well. Training camp follows.

## 7. COUR Report

Ben Reed reported that the meeting of COUR on 20<sup>th</sup> October two changes were made to the Rules.

- a. The Lock keeper's phone number, 01865 777277, has been added to Rule R8.6.b.
- b. Rule R8.9 has been drafted, banning crews from transiting Iffley Lock before sunrise. Crews were already banned from transiting the lock under a flag, and this was included in the new rule.

There was no response to take back to the next COUR meeting.

BR also reported:

- c. that COUR would be writing to the Proctors about Rule 6.1 to try to get some change on the rule banning rowing between 8.30 and 1.00.
- d. that Jon Roycroft had clarified that OxILP was now wholly Brookes.
- e. that the ARA response to the RoSPA was still not out, and that Row Safe had still not been released.

[Row Safe now has been released: <http://www.ara-rowing.org/row-safe>]

## 8. Announcements – Part 2

a. Throw-lines

BR offered throw-lines for sale at the meeting.

b. ARA affiliation fees and Safety Audits

BR reminded captains that these must be dealt with before leaving for home at the end of term.

## 9. Amendment to the Constitution

"We propose to move against the affiliation between ChristChurch and Kellogg College imposed in 2006, which we feel is providing an unfair advantage to what is already a very sizeable and strong boat club in its own right. We propose instead implementation of a more satisfactory and altogether fairer solution to the problem of rowing participation at Kellogg/ChChBC. We propose the permanent deletion of rule C6.3g with immediate effect.

It has not been possible to come up with one universally ideal solution, but we propose two possible options:

a) Replacement of rule C6.3g with 'Members of Kellogg College who are eligible to row in inter-collegiate events will be randomly allocated a college by OURCs for which they will be able to compete in such events'

b) In view of the fact that Kellogg is a sizeable college in its own right with 380 students (more than many college boat clubs which compete in bumps have access to) the college should therefore form its own boat club and members of Kellogg College should be able to compete for this boat club and not for any other college boat club."

Proposed: Joe Abdalla (Magdalen)

Seconded: Tom Woods (Pembroke)

Amendment 1: "with effect from the end of MT08"

Amendment 2: "All Kellogg students currently entered into ChCh regatta 2008 and therefore already part of the ChCh set-up should be allowed to row with the club until the end of Trinity 2009. No one wants to disadvantage novices who are being taught to row as part of the ChCh/Kellogg club and they should be allowed to continue to row with ChCh for the rest of the year."

Colin Groshong read a statement from Colin Smith:

"To the College Captains

RE: Christchurch, Kellogg and the eligibility of Blues rowers.

19/11/2008

In 2004 I was asked to go to the College Captains' meeting to use my vote as a Blue in the Kellogg and Oriel case. Since then, I have been aware of some of the issues regarding Kellogg's affiliation to different colleges, but not all. Having just had a matter of days to get up to speed on this, I cannot comment precisely on the nature of the problems or suggest any long-term solutions yet. However, it does seem clear to me that problems arise primarily where Blues and/or other university triallists are involved. There are a number of short-term and long-term issues that need to be dealt with, but I think it is beyond the scope of a single Captain's meeting to deal with all of these in one sitting. I propose to investigate this matter personally and report back to the next Captain's meeting with some sensible solutions that represent the best course of action for everyone involved.

Where grey areas exist in the eligibility of rowers to compete for a college that they are not normal members of, the rules are relatively clear and many precedents exist. This was clearly demonstrated in the Captain's meeting earlier on this year. However, questions arise where Blues rowers, or potential Blues rowers in particular, are encouraged to row for one college or another where it is possible for them to move. I have experienced this first-hand during my own application process, when I was approached by several colleges who encouraged me to apply in the hope that I would row for them. These situations may not break any rules, but they may have a negative impact on the long-term future of collegiate rowing at Oxford. Below I have listed some of those issues, in no particular order:

1) Shouldn't Kellogg be able to partner with a larger college in order to promote rowing there and eventually develop a Boat Club of their own? This seems like a sensible strategy.

- 2) However, should a larger college that already enjoys a competitive advantage due to funding a facilities be able to add to that advantage even more?
- 3) Should OURC's be encouraging closer competition between colleges, or should they encourage colleges to do all their power to raise their individual levels? I think both arguments could be made powerfully here.
- 4) Should Kellogg and Christ Church be disaffiliated simply because they are fast and have a clear advantage? Or has that advantage been gained unfairly and in bad faith? I have no idea what the answer to the latter is.
- 5) Should separate rules exist for Blues rowers to move between colleges?
- 6) How will our decision on Kellogg and Christchurch affect future Boat Clubs?

As you can see, there are already a wide range of issues and I have only limited knowledge of the issues. I would like some time to investigate this matter more fully before any long-term decisions are made. I believe that this decision will have a lasting impact not just on the success of the two colleges involved, but also on the long-term future of Oxford colleges rowing and on the perception of how the College Captains handle such matters.

I propose to conduct a full, independent investigation into all the issues related. I would talk to all the relevant people and I will take into account short-term and long-term issues, all with the aim of proposing a solution that is in the best long-term interests of Oxford colleges rowing. I will talk with college captains, college coaches, college Master's and Presidents, fellow members of the OURC's Committee, and Blues rowers amongst others. Of course, you, the Captains, will have the final say on any proposals that are made and nothing I suggest will be binding. To that end, I suggest that any major changes to the current state of affairs are left until I can report back to the Captain's in the new year. In any case, Blues rowers will not be able to join their college rowing programs until April at the earliest, so this leaves plenty of time for the dust to settle if any proposed changes are adopted.

If you as Captains will support me and give me the time to fully investigate this, it could be a rare opportunity for us all to have a lasting positive impact on the future of Oxford colleges rowing, and a chance to finally bury an issue that has been the source of so much tension for so long.

Kind regards,

Colin Smith"

Magdalen, Men welcomed CS's review, and asked that it could look at other college affiliations, making reference to those between Wolfson and St Cross, and Wadham and Harris Manchester, then withdrew the original motion.

BR explained that CS wanted the captains to discuss the issues that they would like him to look into.

It was proposed that the review should come up with the statistics of how many students of what kind (under-graduate/post-graduate/Blues) were at each college.

Linacre, Men pointed out that number of students should be clarified. Not all were resident, or rowed. It should consider those eligible for OURCs.

The Estates Bursar, Kellogg, stressed the need for accurate numbers. He noted the figures in the original motion, and pointed out that of all the students at Kellogg, the vast majority were part-time and/or non-residential. Only 105 were full-time residential in college. Of these 45 did PGCEs, therefore the year group able to try rowing numbered only 50-60. He welcomed the investigation by CS.

Lincoln, Women high-lighted the difference between men's and women's rowing, that Christ Church were not numerous on their women's side.

Wolfson, Women asked if the review could include Rule B3.

Pembroke, Men asked if recruitment by people claiming to represent OUBC, but not actually doing so, could be included.

## 10. Amendments to the Rules

a. **B1:** From:

“No current member of a University crew may row in Torpids. This restriction does not apply to University crew spares and other potential substitutes.”

To:

“No current training or competing member of a University squad may row in Torpids.”

Proposed: Ben Reed (OURCs)

Seconded: Ruth Crewe (OUWLRC)

Amendment 1: “University squad rowers and coxes are not allowed to compete in Torpids if they have been selected for an Oxford crew to race against Cambridge in the same year (this does not include designated spares), or if, in the instance of their squad not having made its selection before Torpids, they are still in contention for a seat in such a crew.”

BR explained that this had come from COUR, and that the amendment was more in line with what COUR had intended.

Ruth Crewe pointed out that this had arisen from OUWLRC in 2008 when they selected 6 of the crew and had 4 still vying for 2 seats when Torpids happened. She had felt, as one of the 4, that she should be able to have one race for all the training she had done, and that if it was not going to be the Boat Race it should be Torpids, for her college crew who had just been knocked off the Head.

Ben Harrop-Griffiths noted that Nephthys would no longer be racing Cambridge.

Pembroke, Men asked why Nephthys was being run if it was not racing.

BHG answered that it was good to have spares.

RC stated that it was unusual for a squad not to have selected by Torpids.

St John’s, Men felt it was unfair on the college athlete who lost his seat close to Torpids when the spare was put into the college crew.

BR said this was a matter for the college to take into account if the situation arose.

Trinity, Men questioned whether spares should be allowed to race in Torpids.

BHG replied that this had always been the case.

New, Men noted that it would be a balance as to whether to put the spare in the crew or not.

Magdalen, Men felt that since the spares wouldn’t row in the Boat Race in all likelihood it was penalising them to not let them race in Torpids.

53 for

0 against

2 abstentions

**Motion passed.**

b. **R8.6.b and c:** From:

- "b. Amber Flag (4 bucks): Isis closed to all College crews except Senior Crews as defined in R10. Crews must spin between the red and white posts 100m downstream of Donnington Bridge and upstream of Haystacks Corner and may not spin at Longbridges. River closed between Folly Bridge and Oxford Canal. Navigation of Osney and Iffley Locks prohibited. All crews must be accompanied by a bank rider with, in case of emergency, a throw-line and a mobile phone, programmed with the phone number for Iffley Lock, which is 01865 777277.
- c. Blue Flag (2 bucks): Isis closed to Novice status coxes. Crews must spin between the red and white posts 100m downstream of Donnington Bridge and upstream of Haystacks Corner and may not spin at Longbridges. River closed between Folly Bridge and Oxford Canal. Navigation of Osney and Iffley Locks prohibited."

To:

- "b. Amber Flag (4 bucks): Isis closed to all College crews except Senior Crews as defined in R10. Crews must spin between the red and white posts 100m downstream of Donnington Bridge and upstream of Haystacks Corner and may not spin at Longbridges, except to land. River closed between Folly Bridge and Oxford Canal. Navigation of Osney and Iffley Locks prohibited. All crews must be accompanied by a bank rider with, in case of emergency, a throw-line and a mobile phone, programmed with the phone number for Iffley Lock, which is 01865 777277.
- c. Blue Flag (2 bucks): Isis closed to Novice status coxes. Crews must spin between the red and white posts 100m downstream of Donnington Bridge and upstream of Haystacks Corner and may not spin at Longbridges, except to land. River closed between Folly Bridge and Oxford Canal. Navigation of Osney and Iffley Locks prohibited.

Proposed: Ben Reed (OURCs)  
Seconded: Tom Baker (OURCs)

BR said that the only change was to allow spinning at Longbridges under a flag for crews landing.

56 for  
0 against  
0 abstentions  
**Motion passed.**

## 11. Transfers and similar

a. Katherine La France from St John's College to Exeter College (to TT 2011)

Applying under C6.4.b – typically allowed

"Katherine was Exeter MCR last year and started rowing in the summer. She rowed for the W2 in Eights and would like to continue to row with the group of friends she has made at Exeter."

Proposed: Jessica Houlgrave (Exeter)  
Seconded: Matthew Smith (Exeter)

Pembroke, Men checked that she was a student.

42 for  
0 against  
0 abstentions  
**Transfer passed.**

- b. Ian Bayley from St Stephen's House to Trinity College (to TT 2009)  
 Applying under C6.4.a – typically allowed  
 Proposed: James Thetford (Trinity)  
 Seconded: Rosemary Lobley (Trinity)
- c. Emmanuel Efunbote from St Stephen's House to Trinity College (to TT 2009)  
 Applying under C6.4.a – typically allowed  
 Proposed: James Thetford (Trinity)  
 Seconded: Rosemary Lobley (Trinity)
- d. Martin Gannon from St Stephen's House to Trinity College (to TT 2009)  
 Applying under C6.4.a – typically allowed  
 Proposed: James Thetford (Trinity)  
 Seconded: Rosemary Lobley (Trinity)
- e. Adriana Cruz from St Stephen's House to Trinity College (to TT 2009)  
 Applying under C6.4.a – typically allowed  
 Proposed: James Thetford (Trinity)  
 Seconded: Rosemary Lobley (Trinity)

CG grouped these four together.

0 against  
 2 abstentions  
**Transfers passed.**

- f. Peter Power from University staff to New College (to TT 20???)  
 Applying under C6.4.g – typically allowed  
 "Peter is a novice rower who is a current member of the New College MCR and University staff. He has been a member of the College MCR for the last 3 years and is University staff (Post doc) with a Bodcard. He has decided to try rowing this year having previously played MCR cricket, football and Cuppers Korfbal for New College."  
 Proposed: Sean Nash (New)  
 Seconded: Heather Dootson (New)

Magdalen, Men asked whether New was on his Bod card.

New, Men replied that it wasn't.

BR asked when the transfer would expire.

New, Men said 2009, when his funding ran out.

0 against  
 1 abstention  
**Transfer passed.**

- g. Ari Freisinger from SEH to Pembroke College (to TT 2009)  
 Applying under C6.4.b – typically allowed  
 "Ari Freisinger rowed for Pembroke as an undergraduate and is now reading for a Masters at Teddy Hall. He would like to continue rowing for Pembroke."  
 Proposed: Thomas Wood (Pembroke)  
 Seconded: Joseph Elliott (SEH)

SEH, Men said that he was happy with the transfer.

0 against  
 0 abstentions  
**Transfer passed.**

h. Harriet Teare from Merton to Pembroke College (to TT 2011)

Applying under C6.4.b – typically allowed

"Harriet was an undergraduate at Pembroke. She is currently a graduate at Merton, but had transferred permanently to PCBC in 2005 until the rule changes earlier this year. She would like to renew her transfer and continue to cox for Pembroke."

Proposed: Thomas Wood (Pembroke)

Seconded: John Lee Allen (Merton)

Pembroke, Men said that she had been with PCBC for 7 years, and that Merton were happy with it. (Merton were not present to confirm or deny this.)

0 against

1 abstention

**Transfer passed.**

i. Ben Sussman from Worcester College to Wolfson College (to TT 2011)

Applying under C6.4.b – typically allowed

"Ben was formerly a post-doc at Wolfson and began training with the novices over the summer. Ben then took a research position at Worcester starting on 1 October 2008 but would like to compete in the Christ Church Regatta with the guys he started rowing with at Wolfson. Motion has been approved by the Worcester men's captain."

Proposed: John Kennedy (Wolfson)

Seconded: Chris Cooper (OURCs)

0 against

0 abstentions

**Transfer passed.**

j. Malcolm Spencer from no college St Catherine's College (to TT 2009)

Applying under C6.6 for Captains' permission for Malcolm to row in the 1<sup>st</sup> Torpid and Eight. *[However C6.6 states that staff members will not normally be allowed to row in the college 1<sup>st</sup> Torpid or Eight unless agreed at a Captains' Meeting.]*

"He is currently working as a porter, but is an associate of the MCR and is coming back to do a post grad next year."

Proposed: Toby Smyth (St Catherine's)

Seconded: Catherine Wherity (St Catherine's)

St Catherine's, Men said that he had rowed with Catz for 3 years.

Lincoln, Women asked why he couldn't be an associate member.

St Catherine's, Men replied that they wanted him to be able to row for the 1<sup>st</sup> VIII.

Trinity, Men checked that he was at Oxford.

BR asked whether he was congregation.

St Catherine's, Men said not.

New, Men said it would be spiteful not to let him.

Sarah Steele asked whether he had been accepted for his post-graduate course, pointing out that there was an admissions process, which people seemed to be taking for granted.

St Catherine's, Men said he was definitely coming back.

13 against

35 for

6 abstentions

**Transfer passed.**

k. Rob Winter from New College to St Anne's College (to TT 2010)

Applying under C6.4.a – typically allowed

"Rob is now a clinical medic at New College but did his first three years at St Anne's, which culminated in him being boat club president last year. We are certainly not 'stealing' him from another college since he already has a significant attachment to St Anne's and has no interest in rowing for New College. Given the nature of his course, spending large amounts of time away from Oxford on placements and so forth, we are not anticipating Rob being able to row for our 1st viii but he is very keen to stay involved at some level, and it would be a shame if he is not able to."

Proposed: Henry Freeland (St Anne's)

Seconded: ??? (???)

New, Men was happy with the transfer and would second it.

0 against

0 abstentions

**Transfer passed.**

**12. A.O.B.**

Matt Smith (OURCs) apologised for springing this on captains, but proposed a motion, seconded by Jess Houlgrave (Exeter), for a transfer for Chris Arnold from St Anne's to Exeter until TT 2012. He had been an under-graduate at Exeter, and was doing a DPhil at St Anne's.

0 against

0 abstentions

**Transfer passed.**